

# Meeting Minutes Tuesday, April 23, 2024, 6:00-8:00pm

### 1. Call to Order and Land Acknowledgement

### 2. Roll Call

- a. Commissioners Present:
- b. Julissa Acosta, Ana Avendaño, Nirmala Bandrapalli, Aileen Cassinetto, Dayna Chung, Trish Erwin, Ann Girard, LaSaundra Gutter, Susan Kokores, Aysha Pamukcu, Michelle Stewart, Ellen Tafeen, Susan Takalo, Anisha Weber

Staff: Tanya Beat, Jacki Rigoni

- c. Absent: Jess Hudson, Melissa Lukin, Rosie Tejada, Natalie Handel, Amani Shroff, Joy Zou
- 3. Public Comment Ally Chan (in-person), new legislative aide for Supervisor Corzo
- 4. Action to Set Agenda and Approve Consent Agenda Items

Motion to approve by Anisha Weber, seconded by Nirmala Bandrapalli. Approved.

### **CONSENT AGENDA**

5. Approval of March Meeting Minutes

### **REGULAR AGENDA**

- 6. Leadership Council San Mateo County presented by Kaarin Hardy and Margi Power
  - Programs and How to Apply (deadline May 1)
  - Please review their website for more information.

### 7. RISE 2024 Celebration

- Big thank you from Susan Kokores and Ann Girard to the commission for their work on RISE 2024
- Special recognition to Anisha Weber and Dayna Chung for leading the two sub-committees
- Lovely thank you to Tanya Beat for organizing RISE 2024.

### 8. RISE 2024 Debrief

- Part 1: Add your feedback to the flipcharts with various questions
  - i. What went well?
    - 1. Food! Malia Cohen! Good flow!
  - ii. What could be improved?
    - 1. Need more private / corporate sector people there.
    - 2. People at tables wanted to share their stories rather than answer the questions so that was challenging for feedback facilitators.
    - 3. Missing youth (event during the school day excluded them)

- 4. English as a second language participants was more challenging even though interpretation was available.
- iii. How effectively did the group communicate with each other?
  - 1. Organized meetings, great communication
- iv. What lessons can be applied to future projects?
  - 1. Learned that we had time to meet & good communication as a sub committee.
  - 2. Leverage community partner resources more
  - 3. Need more involvement of all commissioners
  - 4. Split this event into smaller events
- v. What challenges arose?
  - 1. Some people couldn't attend because of how long the event was.
  - 2. Selling out but then there were "no shows"
  - 3. The location was small
  - 4. Multiple entryways of the venue was confusing for people
- vi. Were your goals & objectives met?
  - 1. Yes, "to infinity and beyond..."
  - 2. Topics, location, people
- Part 2
  - i. Event Survey results
    - 1. Great response rate. Attendance was excellent. Most people were NOT on their phones.
    - 2. Ratings over most areas were high except Marketplace. We simply lacked enough time for Marketplace.
    - 2 Open Fields: biggest issues with parking, signage; people LOVED the lunch; needed interpretation for discussion times at small tables; the "childcare" funding just did not work

### 9. Reports

- Youth Commission showcase will be May 23
- Director

### 10. Sub-Committee Break-Outs

- Each committee will meet to plan next steps for May-November
- Review the hand-written feedback; discuss next steps

### 11. Commissioner Announcements

- The Equal Pay Pledge has been signed by the County of San Mateo via Human Resources and Supervisor Corzo.
- Dear Human poem video on YouTube (active hope and relationship building)

### 12. Adjournment



# Meeting Minutes Tuesday, March 26, 2024, 6:00-8:00pm

### 1. Call to Order and Land Acknowledgement

\*Susan Kokores is joining by Zoom due to a contagious illness. Motion to allow her to participate by Nirmala Bandrapalli; second by LaSaundra Gutter. Approved.

### 2. Roll Call

### a. **Commissioners Present**:

- Julissa Acosta, Ana Avendaño, Nirmala Bandrapalli, Aileen Cassinetto, Dayna Chung, Trish Erwin, Ann Girard, LaSaundra Gutter, Susan Kokores (on Zoom), Aysha Pamukcu (late arrival, no vote), Amani Shroff, Michelle Stewart, Ellen Tafeen, Susan Takalo, Rosie Tejada, Anisha Weber Staff: Tanya Beat, Jacki Rigoni
- c. Absent: Jess Hudson, Melissa Lukin, Natalie Handel, Joy Zou
- 3. Public Comment n/a

### 4. Action to Set Agenda and Approve Consent Agenda Items

Motion to approve by Anisha Weber, seconded by Susan Takalo. No vote from Aysha Pamukco. All others on Roll Call Vote Approved.

### **CONSENT AGENDA**

5. Approval of February Meeting Minutes

### **REGULAR AGENDA**

### 6. Celebration of Equal Pay Pledge

- Equal Pay Resolution presented to the Board; created and submitted by Jacki Rigoni. It was
  passed at the March 12 Board of Supervisors meeting. They will move forward to "sign" the
  state's Equal Pay Pledge.
- In the future, this CSW could want to promote this Equal Pay Pledge to all the cities in San Mateo County and encourage them to promote the Pledge to all the employers in their cities.
- Susan Kokores and Ann Girard presented to the BOS at the March 12 meeting. They voted and passed the Women's History Month Proclamation and provided that to us.

### 7. RISE 2024 Conference

- Logistics & Roles of Commissioners
  - Registration/Check in responsibilities
  - Feedback Facilitators responsibilities. Question & Answers
    - Process for picking up handouts, notepads
    - Process for facilitating discussion
    - Process for turning your papers back to the CSW table
    - There will be Q&A cards at each table
    - "Customer service" for the people at your table: encourage them to take breaks, get what they need, etc.

Support for Setting up and Packing up: building opens at 7am. Be there at
 7:30am. We open the doors at 8:15am and start the program at 8:50am.

### 8. Reports

- Youth Commission:
  - i. Read Aloud
  - ii. Civic Engagement Youth Summit
  - iii. Youth Commission Showcase on May 23.

### 9. Next Steps & Post Event Information

- Next Steps after RISE 2024 event
- Sub-Committees will be working on writing their reports
- Do we need more feedback after RISE? Do we have what we need to make our recommendations?
- Women's Equality Day in August
- Present to the Board in November
- Recommendation from Jacki is to be very clear and specific with the written recommendations and especially if it includes costs.
- Will sub-committees meet before the April meeting? If not, then agendize for May (feedback from findings' presentations).
- Use Committee time in the April Meeting to dive into the written feedback and notes.

### 10. Commissioner Announcements

### 11. Adjournment – ended meeting early at 7:30pm

To: San Mateo County Commission on the Status of Women

From: Tanya Beat, Director

Date: May 28, 2024

**Subject:** Status of recent events/projects

### **Contracted Communications Person**

• Main charge is to synthesize our current information into a Report that includes an Executive Summary, findings, and recommendations. Data will be addendums.

• They will work with a design person to create a beautiful and professional document and presentation.

### Women's Equality Day – Tuesday, August 27

Brainstorm and consensus on the event. Must sign up for one of the three groups below.

- Logistics Committee (budget of \$2,000)
- Program Committee
- Outreach Committee

# Commission on the Status of Women Child Care Impact Report 2024

# **Table of Contents**

Table of Contents	1
Executive Summary	5
Introduction	7
Goals	7
Methods & Timeline	8
Definitions	9
What we knew: state/national research	10
The Child Care Landscape	10
Access to Child Care in California	10
Child Care Impact on Kids	11
Brain Growth and Development	11
Kinder-Readiness	11
Children with Special Needs	12
Child Care Impact on Women & Families	12
How Child Care Is Impacting Women in the Workplace	12
How Child Care Challenges are Impacting Families	
Invisible Work	14
Domestic Violence and Family Justice	16
Child Care Impact on Educators	16
Housing & Child Care	17
The Economics of Child Care: Challenges & Opportunities	17
Challenges	17
Opportunity - Economic Multiplier Effect	
COVID19	
COVID-19 National & State Impacts	19
San Mateo County - Local Impacts	
Lessons Learned and Future Efforts	20
Ending Child Poverty	21
Relationship between Wealth, Wages & Caregiving	23
What we knew: local data	25
Child Care Partnership Council 2022 Needs Assessment	25
2022 San Mateo County Nanny Survey	25
Family Child Care Brief	26
Sustainable San Mateo County	
The Well-Being of Children, Youth & Families in San Mateo County 2023 Indicators Report	
Santa Clara County Office of Children and Family Policy	27



2022-2023 Annual Report	27
What we learned: Commission survey + local interviews & RISE Conference feedback	
CSW Child Care Impact Survey Data	
Demographic data on child care impact survey respondents	29
Impact of Child Care Challenges	
Solutions and Recommendations	32
Respondents Free Response	32
Respondents' Suggestions for Business Support:	33
Respondents' Recommendations to Local Leaders:	
Additional Comments and Insights:	33
Individual Stories	33
Community Partner Feedback & Interviews	35
Community Partner Summary Responses	35
Kristen Anderson, Child Care Consultant	
Irma Zoepf, Z-Bridge	35
Family Connections, Non Profit	36
Tina Watts, Community College Faculty	36
Izzi (Head Start)	37
All Five Preschool	37
Family Child Care Organization San Mateo County	37
Community Priorities & Voter Attitudes	38
What we believe	40
Racism and sexism are key drivers of the child care crisis	40
Child care is a human right	42
The Rights of Women	42
The Rights of Children	42
Universal Child Care is Essential	43
RISE Women's Leadership Conference	45
Panel Discussion & Participant Feedback	45
Panel Discussion	45
Participant Feedback	47
Conference Programs & Online Resources	47
What We Can Do - Recommendations for Board of Supervisors	51
Create Office or Department for Children & Families	51
Comprehensive Family Support	51
Climate Change Impacts on Children & Families	52
Family Justice	53
The Essential Role of County Government	53
Child Care Blueprint	54



Dedicate funding for children and families	55
Basic Income	56
San Mateo County Priorities and Strategic Plan	57
What We Can Do - Other initiatives	58
Paid Leave	58
Pennsylvania Case Study	59
Investments in Early Childhood Workforce	60
Wages	61
Professional Development	61
Child Care Employment Benefits for Early Educators	62
SB1307 (Becker) - Child Care subsidies for ECE Workforce	63
Multisector Coalitions	63
Child Care and Housing	63
Center-Based Initiatives	64
Family Child Care Home	64
Local Business and Employer Engagement	64
Mindsets	65
Conclusion	68
Appendices	70
Appendix A: Commission on the Status of Women 2023 Survey Data	
Appendix B: Survey Respondents in their own words	85
Appendix C: San Mateo County Census and Needs Assessment Data	87
Appendix D: Project Timeline	89
2023	89
2024	91
Feedback Methods	92
Communities Served	92
Child Care Challenges & Special Needs	93
Impact of caregiving responsibilities beyond early childhood - for example, for partners, rel or other adults?	
Average Incomes for Families Served	94
Housing for communities served	94
Occupations for communities served	94
Unpaid work	95
Child Care Use, Access & Satisfaction with Care for communities served	95
Accommodations Employers Could Make to Balance Caregiving and Work	96
Child Care Impact on Other Family Members	96
Impact on Women, Including Reduced Hours, Professional Development, Personal & Finandese Wellbeing	



Acknowledgements	99
Recommendations	97
Financial and non-Financial Benefits of Policies like Paid Leave or Universal Child Care	97
Impact of onsite child care	97



## **Executive Summary**

### **Purpose and Scope**

The "Child Care Impact Report 2024," commissioned by the San Mateo County Board of Supervisors and Prepared by the Commission on the Status of Women, delivers a critical evaluation of the lifetime impacts of child care and caregiving on families, educators, and the broader economic landscape of the county. This report is integral to understanding the intersection of child care with economic stability, gender equity, and child development, and aims to inform policy decisions to enhance the overall well-being of the community.

### Methodology

To gather comprehensive data, the Commission utilized a multi-faceted research approach that encompassed a wide-ranging survey distributed across the county, detailed interviews with key stakeholders, analysis of existing research, and input from community forums such as the RISE Leadership Conference. This strategy enabled the collection of both quantitative data and qualitative insights, offering a well-rounded perspective on San Mateo County's child care landscape. The survey involved 389 participants, with 80% aged 30-50 and having children under 18; 20% have a child with special needs. Additionally, 83% rely on child care to maintain employment, 50% engage in unpaid work outside the home, and 44% identify as nonwhite.

### **Key Findings**

We believe that child care is a right and the foundation for lifelong financial security, economic power and overall well-being of women in San Mateo County. It is essential infrastructure and a vital safety net. When women thrive, entire communities flourish.

- Drivers: Racism and sexism are significant factors fueling the child care crisis, manifesting through
  economic injustice, inequitable infrastructure, and entrenched power imbalances. The historical
  undervaluation of caregiving in the United States, rooted in the systemic exploitation of women of color,
  persists today in the form of wage disparities and low pay, with BIPOC women disproportionately
  affected. Chronic underfunding of facilities and workforce development, along with inadequate
  systems, exacerbates gaps in care and hinders cross-sector collaboration. The child care workforce
  often faces poverty wages, and women and caregivers are subject to pay penalties. These issues are
  symptoms of deep-seated racism and sexism that persist due to unaddressed power imbalances.
- Child Care is a Right: Child care is recognized as a fundamental human right essential for empowering women and promoting gender equality. International laws mandate the U.S. to provide accessible and affordable child care, yet there are significant shortfalls, particularly affecting minority women. Civil rights leaders and advocacy groups argue for universal child care to ensure women can fully participate in society and fulfill international gender equality commitments.
- Impact on Women: According to the Commission survey, 88% of respondents report that child care
  issues significantly impact their lives, with 68% delaying or abandoning career opportunities due to
  child care needs. Additionally, 60-70% frequently need to leave work early or arrive late. Half of the
  respondents report losing income and experiencing increased stress or conflict with partners, and over
  20% have reported illness related to these stresses. Our research also indicates that women who exit



- the workforce for even short periods can face a reduction in annual earnings by 39%, a significant penalty that affects their financial stability and career trajectory. The often invisible and unpaid caregiving responsibilities at home combined with pay penalties at work cost women an average of \$17K per year, rising to \$38K for Latinas. Addressing these issues is crucial as advancing women's equality in the workplace could contribute up to \$12 trillion to global GDP by 2025, highlighting the economic necessity of supporting women throughout their careers.
- Impact on Children and Families: Quality child care is essential for the cognitive and social development of children, with 85% of brain growth occurring before age five. Studies consistently show that high-quality early childhood education enhances school readiness and long-term academic achievement. However, a survey in our county indicates that 66% of respondents face difficulties in accessing reliable child care, negatively impacting their employment and economic stability. In San Mateo County, there is a shortfall of 17,000 child care slots. Additionally, 73% of parents have declined work opportunities, and 33% have deferred personal healthcare due to the escalating costs of child care, which often exceed housing expenses. On a national level, investment in the child care sector is waning, despite temporary boosts such as those from the pandemic-related child tax credit. This lack of funding, combined with the high cost of living, poses significant challenges for families remaining in the Bay Area. Over the last decade, San Mateo and Santa Clara counties lost 10% of children from birth to age 5, even while the total population grew, a trend that has intensified since the onset of COVID-19. To counter these trends, there is an urgent need to refocus policies on prioritizing and financially supporting children and families through a comprehensive, multigenerational planning approach.
- Impact on Child Care Providers: Child care providers in the county are frequently underpaid and undervalued, despite the essential services they provide. Many of these providers, predominantly BIPOC women, earn wages below the area's cost of living, resulting in high turnover and a shortage of qualified professionals. Notably, child care educators earn less than 98% of all other professions and are eight times more likely to experience poverty compared to K-8 teachers. Furthermore, 98% of early childhood education (ECE) workers and 80% of adult caregivers are women, most of whom are non-white or immigrants, underscoring the need for equitable wage policies in this sector.
- Multisector Factors (including Housing): Child care significantly influences working parents' ability to maintain employment and manage household budgets, directly impacting economic circumstances and children's well-being. Child care costs substantially strain family finances, often consuming about half of the median mortgage payment and nearly 80% of the median rent. This financial burden hampers women's labor force participation and their ability to afford housing or save for homeownership. Investments in child care yield multiple community benefits, including enhancing property values. Research shows that for every dollar spent on child care, local property values increase by approximately \$13 annually, demonstrating the significant economic impact of accessible and high-quality child care on housing and community development. The 2023 Sustainable San Mateo County report identifies underfunding of child care as a primary cause of economic, housing, and food insecurity. Additionally, stable, affordable housing coupled with quality, affordable child care is crucial for parents' economic stability and children's healthy development, not only easing family budgets but also boosting local property values.
- Economic Impact: Access to affordable, high-quality child care significantly enhances workforce stability by boosting parental labor force participation and economic stability, leading to higher



employee retention and reduced absenteeism for employers. Despite these advantages, the U.S. economy loses approximately \$122 billion annually due to child care-related decreases in earnings, productivity, and revenue, with businesses alone losing \$23 billion, or \$1,640 per working parent. This economic strain extends to government losses of about \$21 billion in tax revenues annually. Internationally, the U.S. falls behind other OECD countries in female labor force participation, largely due to insufficient child care options, suggesting that reducing these barriers could boost GDP by about 5%. Investments in child care not only address immediate economic strains but also offer long-term benefits, including a potential 13% annual return on early childhood investments, and a significant economic multiplier effect, where every dollar spent on child care generates two dollars of short-term economic output, surpassing the typical multiplier of most industries. This underscores the strategic importance of enhancing child care infrastructure to foster economic growth and social mobility.

### Recommendations

### **Board of Supervisors**

- Office of Children & Families: An Office of Children and Families, potentially integrated with a Department of Family Justice, can play a pivotal role in addressing a broad spectrum of issues that affect the wellbeing of children and families, including race or gender wealth/wage gaps, domestic violence, housing, health, and even climate change. Such an office can support multi-sector collaborations to comprehensively enhance the wellbeing of children and families, with significant benefits for women. The development and implementation of a Child Care Blueprint, akin to successful models in San Francisco and San Diego, could offer a systematic and strategic framework to address the complex challenges of child care comprehensively. This would include improving access, affordability, and quality, while ensuring that local resources, policies, and programs are well-coordinated across different departments and agencies. Such a blueprint would facilitate a unified and effective approach to enhancing child care services in the community.
- Dedicated Funding: Dedicated funding for children and families is essential to address the needs of
  women and families in San Mateo County and can be significantly amplified in its effectiveness when
  paired with the establishment of an Office of Children and Families. Integrating funding with structural
  support (ie: Office of Children) would provide a centralized hub to distribute funds strategically,
  ensuring that investments are made in a manner that maximally benefits the community's child care
  needs, including those related to facilities, workforce development and wages, expanded access,
  climate action and basic income programs.

### **General Recommendations**

• Paid Leave: Seventy-five percent of respondents said that policies like expansions to paid leave would significantly improve their well-being and lower stress. San Mateo County leaders can advocate for expansions, drawing examples such as Pennsylvania's plan to increase paid leave up to 20 weeks projects a net annual benefit of \$379 million and an 18 to 1 return on investment. Supporting businesses through incentives and raising public awareness are key steps toward achieving these benefits. Paid leave expansions provide vital support not only for new parents but also for families dealing with various life challenges, from welcoming a new family member to managing serious illnesses.



- Universal Child Care: Universal child care is the policy extension of child care as a fundamental human right, essential for providing every child, regardless of background, an equitable start in life. This approach aims to dismantle systemic inequalities by offering all children access to high-quality early education, significantly supporting women and children most affected by current inadequacies in child care. Implementing universal, free child care would simplify the complex, underfunded system by eliminating stringent eligibility processes and reducing costs through standardized training and economies of scale. Such reforms would level the educational playing field, cut administrative costs, enhance parental workforce participation—especially among mothers—and boost economic growth. Ultimately, universal child care fosters a just and equitable community, empowers women in their professional and caregiving roles, and meets diverse family needs, aligning with broader community development goals.
- Child Care Workforce Investments: Investing in the child care workforce through initiatives to increase compensation and expand professional development has significant benefits for San Mateo County. The Child Care Needs Assessment shows that paying livable wages to early educators could generate an economic benefit of \$389 million annually and address the shortage of 2,829 workers, helping to fill over 17,000 child care spaces. Legislative efforts, such as Senator Becker's SB 1307 (inspired by efforts in Kentucky), which makes ECE workers eligible for state-subsidized child care, exemplify the innovative approaches needed. Additionally, partnerships with local organizations like the Child Care Partnership Council, 4C's, First5, and the Home Childcare Organization play a crucial role in supporting early educators. Career pathways programs like NannyUp/Teacher Up from Upwards Scholars and apprenticeships offer significant opportunities for professional growth, higher wages, and expanded employment prospects. These programs provide structured training and education, often with wraparound support, that help individuals advance in their careers within the childcare and education sectors. These efforts are essential for attracting and retaining skilled early educators and improving the quality of early childhood education in the county.
- Mindset shifts to promote gender equity: Promote Workplace Flexibility: Encourage local businesses to
  adopt more flexible work policies that support working parents, such as remote work options, flexible
  hours, and on-site child care facilities. Advocate for policy reforms at the county and state levels that
  address the root causes of child care challenges, aiming to support economic growth, reduce gender
  disparities, and ensure equitable access to quality child care.
- Strengthen Multi Sector Collaborations: Multi-sector collaborations are essential for achieving local child care, economic, housing, transportation, and environmental goals, offering significant opportunities to boost family incomes, support healthy child development, and advance broader economic and climate objectives. For instance, placing child care facilities near housing, jobs, and transit can significantly reduce car trips and commuting times, which currently can extend by an extra 45+ minutes for many families seeking quality care. A notable example is the partnership between <a href="Greystar/Elco Yard">Greystar/Elco Yard</a>'s and Build Up San Mateo County in Redwood City, which integrates community needs into development projects. This approach not only enhances access to childcare but also supports multi-sector initiatives like housing and environmental sustainability. These collaborations benefit businesses by improving employee retention, productivity, and job satisfaction. At a recent SAMCEDA event, the importance of accessible childcare was underscored, with discussions on how businesses can foster family-friendly



workplaces and improve access to quality childcare, thus enhancing community vitality and economic growth.

The "Child Care Impact Report 2024" underscores the crucial role that accessible, affordable, and high-quality child care plays in the economic and social health of San Mateo County. The findings point to a need for significant investment and reform in the child care sector to support not just children and families, but the economic vitality and future prosperity of the entire community. Implementing these recommendations requires a concerted effort from all sectors of society, including government, businesses, and the community at large, to foster a supportive environment where women and families thrive and children receive the foundational support they need during critical developmental years.

