Attachment I



November 3, 2017

Carlos Zubieta 1725-A Abbot Kinney Boulevard Venice, CA 90291

Subject: Response to Comments on Update to Biological Resources Assessment Report for 199 Arbor Lane, Moss Beach, CA. (APN 037-123-043).

Dear Mr. Zubieta:

This letter provides a response to a comments on the *Update to the Biological Resources Assessment for* 199 Arbor Lane, Moss Beach, California (APN 037-123-043), prepared by Coast Ridge Ecology, October 2, 2017.

In a letter dated October 22, 2017 from the adjacent property owner at 191 Arbor Lane, three (3) comments were made in regards to the Updated Biological Resources Assessment:

Comment #1:

The commenter says there is one 'obvious error' in the Updated BRA. The commenter is referring to a statement that the distance between the edge of the bluff and the Pacifica Ocean was estimated to be 80 feet. The commenter says that the distance is actually between 62 and 67 feet.

Response to Comment #1:

Based on the site plan for 199 Arbor Lane dated October 14, 2016; the estimated distance from the wood deck (which forms the western edge of the building envelope), the distance to the top of the bluff above the Pacific Ocean varies between 88.9 feet and 71.3 feet. This distance was averaged and estimated to be 80 feet.

Comment #2:

The commenter says there is 'one taxonomic classification that is in dispute'.

Response to Comment #2.

The commenter does not provide any additional information to back up the statement that a 'taxonomic classification' in the Update to the BRA is 'in dispute'. No example of a taxonomic classification is given, and it's not clear what the commenter is referring to.

Comment #3a:

The commenter states that the report misrepresents "photograph 5' as stating that it 'shows two trees 27" and 36" DBH', whereas "Photograph 5 actually only depicts the smaller of the two trees".

Response to Comment #3a:

Photograph 5 was referenced in the Update to the BRA to primarily show the story pole installation and mowing that had been done, the flat bluff top, as well as the trees on site. The commenter is correct in that it only shows one of the trees due to the angle the photo was taken. This was not meant to

Attachment I

misrepresent the location of the trees. The trees are shown on the site plan for the project, and they are both located on the flat area of the bluff top.

Comment #3b:

The commenter questions the statement in the Update to the BRA that 'removal of the trees would not cause any impact to Dean Creek, as there would be no disturbance to the steep slope that slopes down to Dean Creek". The commenter also states that 'the author does not have the qualifications' to make this evaluation. The commenter also states that there was 'careful omission of the reality of bluff top erosion',

Response to Comment #3b:

The two Cypress trees referred to by the commenter are both located on the flat bluff top within the proposed building envelope, and are not located along the edge of the bluff. As a biologist with over 22 years of professional experience, having observed tree removals in many types of terrains, I am sure these trees could be easily removed without causing erosion to the edge of the bluff and Dean Creek, based on their distance from the edge of the bluff; however the project's Civil Engineer and Geologist should evaluate this. There was no 'careful omission of the reality of bluff top erosion' as the commenter states.

It should be noted that in some areas near the property at 199 Arbor Lane, the bluff edge that borders the slope that descends to Dean Creek is steep, but not too steep to walk down. I traversed the slope several times when taking distance measurements between the property boundary and the riparian corridor and Dean Creek itself. The bluff edge is well vegetated with native brush (California blackberry) in places and Monterey cypress trees. The project's Civil Engineer and Geologist should provide an evaluation for the potential for erosion of this slope and any potential for impact from the proposed development.

If you have any questions or require further information, please contact me.

Sincerely,

Patrick Kobernus

Senior Biologist/ Managing Member

Coast Ridge Ecology, LLC

Potin Zun